

# Shelter Island Deer & Tick Committee

Meeting Minutes 08/12/09

Meeting called to order by Chairman Lapides at 10:10 am at the Town Hall Meeting Room.

## Attendance:

Committee: Chairman Rae Lapides, Janalyn Travis-Messer, Dr. William Zitek, and Mike Scheibel

Non-Committee: Chief James Read, Jake Williams, Bill Smith, and Richard Kelly, Recording Secretary, Peter Vielbig

## Old Business:

- Dr. Mat Pound's papers have been published in a scientific journal.
- Connecticut Congresswoman Rosa L. De Lauro issued a press release about the USDA's ARS 6 year study of the tick control project in the Northeast.

## New Business:

➤ Chairman Lapidés opened by asking the attending public to hold all comments and questions until a designated time later in the meeting. Then she began a discussion on each point listed on the two “Fact Sheets” which she handed out to the committee members. She commented that these sheets have been handed out around the island specifically on the evening before the Movie..Under My Skin was shown at school and these handouts were written by others and not the Deer and Tick Committee.

➤ Chief Read asked if there were any issues on the agenda requiring his input. Chairman Lapidés said no and Chief Read thanked her and excused himself from the meeting.

➤ Chairman Lapidés went through the lists topics on each “Fact Sheet”, item by item, and read a discussion/rebuttal of each item a response by Dr. Mat Pound, Scientist with the USDA/ARS and Vinnie Palmer, at the D.E.C. Notes of Dr. Pound’s comments and Vinnie Palmer’s letter are attached and are self-explanatory.

➤ During the presentation by Chairman Lapidés Dr. Zitek and Mike Scheibel made several comments. Dr. Zitek made the following points:

1. That the 4-Poster is a controlled vector target only process, not a broadcast application of Permethrin. That to equate the 4-Poster process with broadcasting spraying in terms of permethrin entering the environment is a misleading and dishonest statement.

2. Lab tests on mice and rats are conducted to establish a baseline: the chemicals are given orally, not topically, and in extremely high doses over prolonged periods of time to see what effects, if

any, occur and if they do occur, when.

3. If permethrin is misapplied, i.e. broadcast spraying too close to water sources then it is dangerous and in accordance with product labeling, should not be used within specified setbacks or buffers . The 4 posters have been located to keep them away from these open water sources.

4. The deer carcass sampling protocol will be changed to insure better controls to prevent contamination of the internal muscle when dissecting from the external skin.

5. In response to a question raised by Bill Smith on the qualifications of the Deer and Tick Committee to make educated and scientific statements Dr. Zitek replied that we are educated in order to learn how to gather and evaluate knowledge made available to us by others, do research and use that information so we can find the answers and make accurate statements by gathering based on this information gathered, from the many sources that are available to us today.

➤ Mike Scheibel also commented on the following:

1. A good portion of the information on one of the facts sheets came from a single website, the NW Coalition for Alternatives to Pesticide (CAP), a non-profit organization with a stated agenda-Reform However, we should look for alternatives to pesticide whenever possible and practicable.

2. At this point Rae agreed with Mike on looking for alternative to pesticide and said that it was on this point that we choose the 4-Poster Program as it puts much less pesticide into the environment than any other existing program...especially broadcast spraying.

3. The EPA is the best site for getting information on the use or misuse of pesticides.

4. That the use of the terms acute toxicity and non-toxic and bioaccumulation are seemingly at conflicting uses. If a toxic

substance causes an organism to die in a short period of time, it is difficult to understand how could bioaccumulate at the same time.

5. Yes, Permethrin does kill bees, it is an insecticide and bees are insects, but the 4-posters do not attract bees.

Bill Smith and Richard Kelly frequently interrupted the discussion among the committee and were met with admonitions from Chairman Lapidés to please be silent and that they would have the opportunity to speak at the end of this part of the agenda.

Committee member Janalyn Travis Messer reported on cases of people who were diagnosed with MS but really had Lyme disease and were cured from the symptoms once they were treated for Lyme.

At the conclusion of the reading of the comments of Dr. Pound and Letter by Vinnie Palmer, Chairman Lapidés opened the meeting to discussion from the floor.

Bill Smith asked if there could not be a public forum to discuss the 4 Poster Situation with representatives from each side presenting their points and then letting the public decide where they come down on the issue. Mike Scheibel responded that they have already presented the information at its regular meetings and other forums.

Richard Kelly asked if the data being used by the Deer and Tick Committee was anecdotal not real science. He will bring the data that backs up his claims to the next Deer and Tick Committee meeting.

Bill Smith asked for copies of the correspondence discussed at the meeting and Chairman Lapidés asked for a copy of the email from the USDA to which Bill Smith had made several references. After

some discussion an agreement was reached on how to exchange those documents.

Attached:       Dr. Pound's discussion notes  
                  Vinny Palmer's Response  
                  Rosa De Lauro's Press release

Meeting adjourned by Chairman Lapidés at 11:40 am.